CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF UNIVERSALIZATION OF PRIMARY EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN

Dr. Sarfraz Khawaja Kh. Sabir Hussain

Academy of Educational Planning & Management Ministry of Education, Islamabad

October 2000



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction

- 1.1. Constitutional responsibility
- 1.2 Legislation for compulsory Primary Education.
- 1.3. Administration and supervision
- 1.4. Review of Education Policies: 1947-90
 - 1.4.1 Education policies 1947-82
 - 1.4.2. Education Policies in the 1990s.
 - 1.4.3 Policy Targets and Strategies
- Achievements of Five Years Plan.
- Social Action Program (SAP)
- Primary Education Development Projects
 - 4.1. Primary Education Project
 - 4.2. Girls Primary Education Development Project I&II
 - 4.3. Primary Education Development and Expansion Project in AJK
 - 4.4. NWFP Basic Education Project
 - 4.5. Sindh Primary Education Development Project
 - 4.6. Balochistan Primary Education Development Programme
- 5. Elimination of Disparities
- Public Private partnership
- Enrolment/Participation Rate
- 7.1. Major factors Affecting Enrolment in Primary Schools
 - 7.1.1. Distance and Access to Primary School
 - 7.1.2. Income of Household
 - 7.1.3. Education of parents
- 7.2. Causes of low Enrolment of girls
- Issues in participation
 - 8.1 Existing participating rate
 - 8.2 Drop-out
 - 8.3 Non-Enrollments reasons of low participation
- Issues and concerns related to curriculum
- 9.1. The Existing situation
- 10. Conclusion
- 11. Bibliography

INTRODUCTION

This paper is an analytical report about the state of education, at the primary level in Pakistan. It describes what is commonly called the state of the art. An attempt has been made to be realistic in analysis as far possible. The overall approach to write this conceptual paper has been to reflect socio-cultural milieu and how, it sustains the Primary Education in the country. In addition, nation-wide analysis regarding targets and achievements is predominant in this paper considering the quantitative expansion as well as qualitative improvement in the country.

The education system of Pakistan comprises several systems. The two basic categories are those of the Western and Islamic models. The Western system is well formalized as compared to the other. However, while the Western system is elitist in its working the Islamic system is religious in its approach. Both the major sub-systems embody institutions, which differ in their curricula, provision of physical facilities, demands on the students and teachers in the quality of their turn out. However, in pure quantitative terms the most predominant system is the one funded by the government whether it is formal or non-formal.

Along with the plurality of educational systems, which is a legacy from the colonial days, Pakistan started its life with a school system, which was pre-dominantly suited to urban areas and to serve the limited, needs of colonial administrators. The father of Nation, Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, expressed his wish to transform this system right in 1947 and to bring it in line with the changed realities and aspirations of a free nation. This has been followed up by similar policy pronouncements from time to time aimed at bringing about substantial structural changes and reorientation, towards achievement of National objectives of socio-economic development and security. Efforts have been made, to reform the system, but sheer demographic pressures, a sudden upsurge in the demand for education as a consequence of rising aspirations of free people, assertion at human rights including right to education compelled the system to grow within short period of time. The main thrust of educational developments, have accordingly been to enlarge existing educational establishments as rapidly as possible with relatively little change in its structure, logistic, content and methods. The major aim -certainly a laudable one - has been to boost the number and percentage of young people attending institutions at all levels. Progress has been largely measured by

statistics of enrolment, participation rates and overall educational expenditures. The main impulse has been, in fact, to do on a larger scale what was done before which frequently meant doing it less well, whereas the times called for accompanying greater quantitative expansion with equally great qualitative changes and enhanced relevance to socio-economic needs of the society.

CONSTITUTIONAL RESPONSIBILITY

Education is primarily a provincial subject. However, under the 1973 Constitution, it has been put on the concurrent list and the Federal Government has been given the responsibility to make Policy, Planning for the promotion of educational facilities in the federating units to meet the needs and aspirations of the people. The Federal government also acts as advisory authority regarding the overall policy formulation and coordinating the federating units.

2. LEGISLATION FOR COMPULSORY PRIMARY EDUCATION

A part from motivational campaigns, primary education has also been made compulsory through legislation by the Government of Punjab. Other Provinces of Pakistan are working along similar lines. NWFP government has already approved the compulsory primary education bill. However, enforcement is still pending. Poverty, high opportunity cost and lack of adequate facilities and services at an easily accessible distance are some of the main causes for the delay in the enforcement of compulsory primary education in Pakistan. Current National Education Policy (1998-2010) envisages promulgation and enforcement of a free and compulsory primary education act in a phased manner.

ADMINISTRATIONS AND SUPERVISION

Primary education consist on grade I-V and cover the age 5-9 children. All Primary schools are being looked after by separately male and female District Education Officer with the assistance of Assistant Education Officer/Deputy Education Officer and SDEO. One head teacher and three or two teachers are posted in a primary schools. However, only one teacher runs the mosque school in the country. Pakistan Literacy Commission has also established non-formal schools all over the country but the whole process in its infancy hence the Non-formulation education remains a non-entity.

REVIEW OF EDUCATION POLICIES: 1947-90

4.1 Education policies 1947-82

In 1947, only a few months after independence an all Pakistan Education conference was convened, and recommended that free and compulsory education should be introduced for a period of five years, which, should gradually to be raised to eight years. The Commission on National Education (1959) recommended compulsory education for all children between five and ten years of age. However, the New Education Policy (1970) fixed 1980 as target data for achieving universal primary education. Whereas, the National Education Policy (1972-80) aimed at free and universal till class X to be achieved in two phases. Education till class VIII was made free from 1992. The free education was extended to class IX and X in 1974. The National Education Policy (1979) phased the target dates 1987 for boys and 1992 for girls.

4.2. Education Policies in the 1990s.

During the current decade, two education policies were announced: (i) the Education Policy of 1992, and (ii) the Education Policy (1998-2010). In addition to these policies, the Social Action Program (SAP) also lays great emphasis on primary education.

The Education Policy (1992) focused on: (i) achieving universal primary education, eliminating drop-out rates, and fulfilling the basic learning needs by the year 2002, (ii) stressing women's education, (iii) raising the quality of public instruction through an extensive in-service teachers' training program, (iv) diversification of vocational streams, along with expansion of graduate and postgraduate level courses, (v) reforming of examination system, (vi) introducing computer reduction at school level, and (vi) encouraging the participation of private sector in education.

The main features of the new Education Policy (1998-2010) include:

- Quality of elementary education shall be improved.
- Access to elementary education shall be increased, through effective and optimum utilization of existing facilities and services, as well as provision of new facilities and services.
- Character-building, oriented towards humanism, tolerance, and moral build up on Islamic lines at elementary level shall be assigned top priority.
- Teachers' competence shall be improved and the relevance of training programmes for teachers shall be ensured.
- Kachi class at primary level shall be introduced as part of the effort to improve the achievement of pupils.
- The role of the family, school, community, non-governmental organizations and media in the provision of elementary education shall be maximized.
- Disparities and imbalances of all types shall be eliminated so as to promote equity.
- High priority shall be accorded to the provision of elementary education to the outof-school children.
- Financial resource base of elementary education shall be diversified.
- Non-formal system shall be adopted as complementary to formal system.

- A monitoring system shall be developed to obtain timely and reliable information on enrolment, retention, completion and achievement. In addition, qualitative monitoring of achievement shall be introduced.
- Management and supervision shall be improved through greater decentralization and accountability.

PHYSICAL TARGETS OF NATIONAL EDUCATION POLICY (1998-2010)

In order to increase the access and improve the quality of elementary education, the following additional facilities will be provided:

Physical Targets in Elementary Education

TABLE 1

Facilities/Services	Benchmark 1996/97	Policy Target	9th Plan Targets (2000-2003)
New Formal Primary Schools	145,000	190,000 (+45,000)	162,000 (+17,000)
Mosque Schools	37,000	57,000 (+20,000)	40,000 (+3,000)
Double Shift in Existing Primary Schools		20,000	20,000
Non-Formal Basic Education Schools	7,117	2,50,000 (+242,823)	82,177 (+75,000)
Up-gradation of Primary Schools to Middle/Elementary Level	15,000	60,000 (+45,000)	30,000 (+15,000)
Recruitment of Additional Teachers for Primary Schools	339,500	527,000 (+187,500)	382,200 (+42,700)

Source: National Education Policy (1998-2010 P.29)

More than half a dozen Education Policies have been designed since the inception of Pakistan.

The targets fixed by the policies make an interesting reading because of shifting targets dates to longer periods. More-over no consistent strategies were designed to (1947) adopted the strategy to

achieve the U.P.E. by buying a special tax to finance primary education and encouraging the private sector to open primary schools. Whereas National Education Commission (1959) changed the strategy by emphasizing compulsory religions education. The New Education Policy (1970) shifted the strategy towards the attraction of the schools so that dropout rate could be reduced. Detail is given in the following table about the targets dates with strategies.

Summary Table TABLE 2

Policy Targets and Strategies Summary

Policy	Targets	Strategies
1947 Pakistan Education Conference	Free and Compulsory Education UNP within two decades by 1967	Free and Compulsory Levying a special Tax to finance primary education. Primary School Age Group between 6-11 years. Encourage private sector to open primary schools.
1959 National Education Commission	UPE within a period of 15 years by 1974.	Compulsory and universal primary education Compulsory religious education. Female teachers for primary education. Resource mobilization for additional funds.
1970 The New Education Policy	Universal Enrolment upto class V by 1980	Attractive schools to eliminate drop out Rapid expansion Emphasis on female enrollment. Female teachers for primary education
1972 The Education Policy	UPE for boys by 1979 for girls by 1984	- Fee primary education - Priority to rural areas - Emphasis on female enrolment - Standardized low cost school buildings
1979 National Education Policy	UPE for boys by 1986-87 for girls by 1992	-Rapid expansion of female education opening of mosque and Mohalla schools Efforts to reduce drop-outs
1992-2002 National Education Policy	UPE through community participation 100% participation by 2002 Restructuring the existing Education System	Training and recruiting new primary teachers Active participation of community for UPE Special programme to retain female students Provision of Special Federal Fund for Primary Schools

1998-2010 National Education Policy	Enhancing participation rate from 71% to 90% by 2003 and 105% by 2010. Reduction of disparities by 2010 Opening of 45000 New Formal Primary Schools.	Revision of service structure of teachers. Uniform curricula for public and private schools. Political will for objective achievement and resource mobilization of Primary schools. Free and compulsory primary education Act shall be enacted and enforced in phased manner. Revision of the examination and assessment system.
-------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

TARGETS AND ACHIEVEMENTS OF FIVE-YEAR DEVELOPMENT PLANS

The first five-year development plan was developed in 1955-60. Since than we have made eight development plans and 9th is under implementation. In these development plans, primary education has been given proper weight. More financial resources have been allocated in subsequent plan, as compared to previous one for the development of Primary Education.

Several plan documents proposed targets dates to achieve Universalization of primary education. However, theses dates were politically motivated and unrealistic. In every plan the shifting of dates indicated the non-seriousness of Government commitment which is also manifest from financial allocation.

Universalization of Primary Education Target Dates (Plan-Wise)

Table No. 3

Plan	Target date
First Plan (1955-60)	1975
Second Plan (1960-65)	1975
Third Plan (1965-70)	1980
Non-Plan (1970-78)	1979 (Boys) 1984 (Girls)
Fifth Plan (1978-83)	1987

Sixth Plan (1983-88)	1988 (Boys) 1992 (Girls)
Seventh Plan (1988-93)	1993
Eighth Plan (1993-98)	1998

Source: Policies and Plans Review 1947, 1998

Plan-Wise financial allocation detailed is given in the following table.

Plan Wise Financial Situation of Primary Education

Table No. 4

Plans	Education Budget (Rs. Million)	Allocation to Primary Education (Rs. Million)	Percentage Share	Inter-Plan increase (%)
First Plan 1955-60	304.93	51.4	16.85	
Second Plan 1960-65	490.0	78.0	15.92	60.7
Third Plan 1965-70	1086.6	67.51	6.21	121.7
Non-Plan 1970-78	2998.14	473.93	15.81	175.9
Fifth Plan 1978-83	10698.0	3049.7	28,51	256.8
Sixth Plan 1983-88	18830.0	7000.0	37.17	76.0
Seventh Plan 1988-93	22684.78	10128.0	44.64	20.5
Eighth Plan 1993-98	69031.70	32669.0	47.32	204.3
Ninth Plan 1998-2003	120020.0	69860.0	57.80	73.8

Source: Five Years Development Plans Planning and Development, Ministry of Education

This table shows that percentage of financial allocation has been increased gradually. The share of Primary education in the first plan was 16.85% this has been reduced in the second and third plan upto 6.21%. However, the successive plans had substantial share. The fifth allocated 2.51% of the total budget whereas this has been increased upto 37.17% in the sixth plan. The seventh plan increased from 37.17% to 44.64% whereas eighth plan allocation was 47.32% of the total budget.

However, this financial allocation did not bring desired result because merely allocation in the plans cannot achieve the target unless actual expenditure is made. Plan-Wise actual expenditure is shown in the table 4.

Plan-Wise Allocation, Expenditure on Primary Education (1955-2003)

Table No. 5

Plan	Allocation for primary education (in millions) rupees	Actual expenditure on primary education (in million) rupees	Expenditure in (percentages)
1955-60	51.4	21.2	41.0
1960-65	78.0	19.0	24.0
1965-70	68.5	25.0	36.5
1970-78	473.9	444.0	94.0
1978-83	3049.7	1413.1	46.3
1983-88	7000.0	3533.0	50.5
1988-93	10128.0	6399.2	63.0
1993-98	32669.0	23340.4	71.4
1998-2003	69880.0		

Source: 1. Agenda for Educational Development 1988-93.

2. Seventh Five Years Plan (1988/89-1992/93).

3. Education: Past, Present and Future

Plan-Wise Participation Rates at Primary Level Of Education Table No. 6

Five years Plans	Bench Mark	Target	Achievement
First Plan 1955-60	52	58	36
Second Plan 1960-65	36	56	45
Third Plan 1965-70	45	70	46
Non Plan 1970-78	46	65	54
Fifth Plan 1978-83	54	68	48
Sixth Plan 1983-88	48	75	64
Seventh Plan 1988-93	64	79.7	68.9
Eighty Plan 1993-98	68.9	87.7	72.4
Ninth Plan 1998-2003	72.4	90	

Source:

 Primary Education Improvement Desired Measures National Education Council August, 1986

2. Five Years Development Plans

3. Policies and Plans Review, 1947-1998

Different Governments made efforts in increase number of primary schools, enrolment and budget. There has been substantial increase to the budget and enrolment however, found that there are more primary schools age group children out of schools than within the schools. Another, determents of quality and given rates of students which has problems of its own nature.

Primary Education Development in Pakistan During the Five-Year Plan (1955-98) Table No. 7

	(1955-60)	2nd Plan (1960-65)	3rd Plan (1965-70)	Non-Plan (1970-78)	5th Plan (1978-83)	6th Plan (1983-88)	7th Plan (1988-93)	
New Schools Larget Achievement	2,442	14,688	8,701	12,674	9,102	4,198 (Primary) 40,000 (Mosque) 26,684	34,613 (Primary) 20,000 (Mosque) 21,000 (Primary) 13,000 (Mosque)	
Additional Enrolment (in mill.) Target Achievement	6 m 0.28 m	1.2 m 1.15 m	2.8 m 0.86 m	1.1 m	2.68 m 1.16 m	2.8 m 1.52 m	4.6 m 3.1 m	
Participation Rate Target Achievement	36%	2%	46%	24%	68%	75%	100% 68.9%	
Development Budget (in Rs. million) Allocation Expenditure	52.8 23.0	19.0	200.0	605.0	3049.7	3500.0	11900.0	

Source: Ministry of Education Government of Pakistan

Provincial Scenario

billion; NWFP Rs.8.5 billion; Balochistan Rs. 2.3 billion and Federal Rs. 3.0 billion. Yearly allocations and other details are given in the Total allocations for the development of primary education during (1990-99) have been Rs. 29.5 billion which is certainly inadequate in view of needs and requirements of the country. The Province allocations are as follows; Punjab Rs.12.5 billion; Sindh Rs.5.3 following table:

Development Budget Province Wise Table No. 8

Primary Development budget allocations by province (Public Sector) year wise since 1990

Total 1990-99 12,586 29,539 5,262 8,492 2,297 881 (Rs. in million) 1998-99 1850.47 1389.71 446.49 83.45 83.41 3,853 2,395.00 1997-98 1,710.28 158.96 791.75 47.49 5,280 2,749.59 2,810,00 1,160,03 1,642,86 1996-97 132.60 8,495 1995-96 1,986,81 196.38 3,575 710.63 609.00 72.61 1994-95 2,062.16 235.07 468.00 105.09 2,924 53.56 1993-94 1,059.50 391.63 2,012 386.00 149.87 25.20 1992-93 1,007.25 126.00 138.97 274.13 1,561 18.21 1991-92 123.65 296.32 150.61 346.95 850 35,41 Balochistan Province/ Punjab Federal Sindh NWFP Total Area

Source: Planning and Development Wing Ministry of Education.

Recurring allocations from 1990-99 come out to be 168.5 billion, which is almost six times more than the Development allocations during the same period. More than 95 per cent of the recurring budget is consumed by salaries of teachers and other expenses leaving less than 5 percent for, A.V aids, teaching learning materials and other and other such necessities.

The Provincial break-up of recurring budget is given in the following table:

Non-Development Budget Province Wise Table No. 9

Primary Education recurring budget allocation by province (Public Sector) year wise since 1990

			The state of the s						(KA. III HIIIIDH)
rovince/area	1991-92	1992-93	1993-94	1994-95	1995-96	1996-97	1997-98	1998-99	Total 1990-99
Punjab	5,941.72	6,018.27	7,882.06	9,404.85	12,248.42	14,788.71	17,889.80	19,885.74	98,820
Sindh	2,336.56	2,685.75	3,132.02	3,982.30	4,761.83	4,944.85	5,687,26	8,434,48	37,589
WWFP	1,559.69	1,784.17	1,799.08	2,473.93	2,849.61	3,344.12	3884.76	4,306.70	23,225
Balochistan	615.18	750.00	921.57	921.57	721.43	992.95	1,056.00	1,313.33	7,767
Federal	112.64	138.47	106.21	114.24	135.80	153.71	157.53	170.89	1,185
Total	10,565.79	11,376,66	14,239.70	17,332,94	21,164.62	21,164.62 24,708.44	29,272.35	3,4703.13	16,8590

Source: Planning and Development Wing Ministry of Education.

SOCIAL ACTION PROGRAM (SAP)

During the 1980s, Pakistan had the fifth fastest growing economy in the world. However, in terms of human development, the country ranked 120th on the human development index. Three major reasons identified for the slow-moving indicators included:

- Resources allocated to social sectors were too low;
- (ii) Rapidly growing population, and
- (iii) Serious implementation constraints, on the efficient and productive use of resources, that were made available to the social sectors.

As response to this grave imbalance, the government developed a Social Action Program (SAP) in 1992/93, which addressed the needs of primary education (especially female education), primary health, population welfare, and rural water supply and sanitation. The first phase of SAP (1992-96), launched at a total cost of USS 7.7 billion, intended to improve the coverage, quality and effectiveness of service delivery in these sectors. Actively supported by the donor community, SAP was developed and implemented at the provincial level.

The overall SAP strategy comprised three critical elements:

 Improving implementation: by addressing the issues related to poor planning and budgeting, institutional constraints such as bureaucratic delays in release of budgeted funds, lack of trained staff, staff absenteeism, and lack of input supplies, etc. so that social service delivery can be improved.

- Improving program design: by shifting focus to basic services rather than higher-level services, and targeting poor women and girls especially in far flung rural areas, and by improving service quality to improve the access to social services
- Increasing level of effort: by increasing government expenditure on basic social services.
- Education Component of SAP: Education is the most important component of SAP, enjoying the highest share of resources allocated. SAP places great emphasis on primary schooling, particularly with reference to increasing enrolment, and improving the quality of education imparted, with special emphasis on female and rural areas.

In education, SAP followed a demand driven strategy that aimed at:

- Improving the efficiency with which public education services are provided
- Increasing access to schools and
- Improving the quality of schooling provided.

A range of measures designed to achieve these objectives included:

- Decentralization of management systems
- Up-gradation and implementation of planning, budgeting and monitoring systems
- Upward adjustment of teacher staffing levels, with freeze on primary teacher recruitment lifted.
- · Control, through supervision, absenteeism, high transfer rates, and poor teacher

performance.

- Significant increase in budgets, and spending on books and other teaching materials.
- Increased access to schooling through school construction, school extension and classroom renovation.
- Promotion of greater community involvement in school management

Reviews suggest that SAP-I has had a positive impact, on the provision of quality education, in rural areas. There has been a quantitative shift in awareness about the importance of education, as women and girls have been primary beneficiaries of the improved education system. However, little progress appears to have been made in institutional reforms. Also, SAP implementation remained poorly coordinated. Procurement procedures overlapped, attempts at promoting community participation were weak, and monitoring and evaluation systems remained under-developed.

The second phase of SAP (1997-2001/2), costing over US \$ 10 billion, has been evolved, to consolidate the outcomes of the first phase, with the following cross-sectoral objectives to improve quality, efficiency, sustainability and governance:

- Continue increasing the non-salary portion of the recurrent budget, to ensure adequate provision of quality inputs
- Improve governance through merit-based staff recruitment, facilitate site selection and employment incentives, and measures to reduce absenteeism among staff.
- Strengthen government systems of service delivery through improved planning,
 management, monitoring and implementation, including financing non-government

provision of services, and

- Increase community and beneficiary participation.
- Under SAP-II, the scope of some areas has been widened, with education extended to include
 middle-level schooling, health expanded to incorporate tehsil-level facilities (tehsil
 hospitals), and peri-urban areas covered under water supply and sanitation. The important
 role of non-formal education (NFE), as a means of improving literacy and educational levels,
 has also been recognized.

PRIMARY EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS

Efforts are being made to eradicate illiteracy and promote primary education in all provinces of Pakistan, including AJK, in collaboration with the Provincial Education Departments and foreign donor agencies. A number of development projects in the area of primary education are being implemented with the assistance of the World Bank, Asian Development Bank, OPEC, EEC, USAID, UNDP, UNESCO, UNICEF, JICA, NORAD, GTZ and other donor agencies.

An overview of the major Primary Education Development Projects implemented during the 1990's is as follows:

1 Primary Education Project

For qualitative improvement and quantitative expansion of primary education in the province of Punjab, the Third Primary Education Project was launched, costing US\$252.35 million. The cost included a loan of US\$145. Million from the World Bank and a grant of US\$ 17.5 Million from the EEC. Under this project, 8993

Primary Schools were constructed and made functional in Punjab. New text books
based on an integrated curricula were developed and introduced in Punjab.

2. Girls Primary Education Development Project I and II

With the financial assistance of the Asian Development Bank, a project costing Rs. 1762.95 Million was completed in 1996 in four Provinces. Under this project, 880 Community Model Schools were established and made functional in rural areas by providing all required educational inputs. The second phase of the project has been in progress since January 1998, and the total cost of the project is US.S.78 million (ADB US.\$ 45 million OPEC 16 million GOP 17 Million). The project aims at establishing 900 Community Model Schools, 173 Teacher Resource Centers and Quality Improvement Cells.

3. Primary Education Development and Expansion Project in AJK.

A Primary Education Development and Expansion Project was launched in AJK with the assistance of OPEC funding; Rs.108.9 million. The amount was utilized for construction of 255 primary schools.

4. NWFP Basic Education Project

With a view to improve the literacy rate and the quality of elementary level

education, the Primary Education NWFP Project, costing Rs. 13510 million, has been in operation since 1994-95. It has been co-financed by several donor agencies. Of the total cost, 27 per cent will be provided by the donor, while the remaining 63 per cent is being provided by the NWFP Government. Construction work of 3181 schools was completed and 1100 new teachers were appointed during the first two years of this project. Moreover, procurement of instructional material worth Rs.72 million is underway.

5. Sindh Primary Education Development Project

The Sindh Primary Education Development Project has been revised to accommodate some changes in the scope and cost of the project. It was started in September 1990 at a cost of Rs.4284.3 million. 3748 two-room primary schools of the target 5250 were constructed by 1996. Similarly, 170 five-room primary schools of the target 475 were established. Moreover, 1864 additional class rooms were added to existing buildings, 5299 teachers were trained and 655 girls were provided with scholarships by 1996.

6. Balochistan Primary Education Development Programme

The Balochistan Primary Education Development Programme (1993-98) was launched with the financial assistance and collaboration of World Bank. The programme include inputs such as:

Construction of 3000 new girls schools and buildings for 2000 boys schools;

- Repair of 2800schools;
- Mobile and Teacher Training programmes; and
- Instructional materials for 1000 schools.

ELIMINATION OF DISPARITIES

In order to eliminate the existing urban/rural and male/female imbalances and disparities the Government has taken a number of steps. In future all new schools will be mixed schools and 70 per cent of teachers in the new schools will be female. The recruitment age of female teachers has been relaxed to increase their availability. To retain young girls in rural schools, free textbooks, stipends and nutritional food are being provided in disadvantaged and far off areas. This has resulted in an increase in enrolment and a reduction in the drop out rate. More than two-thirds of all primary schools opened in the rural areas of Pakistan have been opened to address the historic imbalance of boys being educated at the expense of girls.

PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP

In order to facilitate the rapid expansion of primary education, Education Foundations have been set up in all Provinces and at the national level. According to the governing principles of the foundations, 50 per cent of the cost of opening new primary schools will be provided by the private sector, NGOs and community organizations, and the remaining 50 per cent will be provided by the government, in the form of grants and loans. In addition, for a period of five years 25 per cent of the recurring cost will be met by the sponsor and 75 per cent by the government. The programmes under implementation by the National Education Foundation include the Community Support Rural Programme; the Urban Fellowship Programme; Training of Private School Teachers; Financial Assistance to Private schools and NGOs programme; the Education Programme for Working Children; and Participatory Development Programmes.

ENROLMENT/ PARTICIPATION RATE

According to Economic Survey (1999-2000) total enrolment at primary level is 20 million (male 11 million and female 8.6 million). The over all participation rate at primary stage is 89 percent (boys 99 percent and girls 79 percent) with approximately 45 percent drop out rate.

1 Major factors Affecting Enrolment in Primary Schools

The Pakistan Integrated Household Survey (PIHS), 1998 highlighted the following main factors which adversely affect the primary school enrolment rate, thus contributing to the problem of non-attendance and low participation rate.

2. Distance and Access to Primary School

A boy's primary school was located within 1 km of the 77 per cent of the Primary Sampling Units (PSUs)/villages/settlements in the country, whereas a girls' primary school was located within 1 km in 69 per cent of the PSUs. In urban areas, both government and non-government schools appear to be equally accessible, and approximately four-fifths of all PSUs had each of these types of school within 1 km. In rural areas, however, access to non-government primary schools was markedly poorer, and less than one out of every 5 PSUs is within 1 km of a non-government school.

Boy's access to primary level schooling was similar across all provinces of the country. Girls' access to primary level schooling in rural Sindh, however, was markedly poorer than in other parts of the country. Only 31 per cent of PSUs in Sindh had a school located within 1 km, compared to 60 per cent for the country as a whole.

3. Income of Household

Household incomes are an important factor in determining whether or not children in a particular household attend school. The lower the income of a particular household, the less likely it is able to afford to pay tuition fees and other schooling related expenses. The likelihood that a child has ever attended school increases as the income of the household increases. It therefore appears plausible that a child's likelihood of attending school will be inversely related to the number of other children in the household as, holding household income and other relevant factors constant, the greater the number of children in a given household, the less money will be available for each child's schooling, thus lowering the chance that the child ever attends school. Research indicated that there is a close relationship between the income of parents and more years of schooling of their children. The major findings of the research in this regard are as under:

 Poverty is the main problem, which do not permit children of poor families to either join or continue education.

- ii. Children of literate have more interest in education. The families where father or mother are literate. Children's enthusiasm for education in greater.
- iii. Illiterate parents are found conservative sticking to their traditional values.
 Their conservatism has a strong negative affect on female education.

4. Education of Parents

The most frequently cited reasons why a child did not attend school were that the parents did not allow the child to attend school. Research further indicated that:

- Attitude of literate fathers and mothers is positive towards education of their children.
- Illiterate fathers are less interested in education of their children; whereas
 illiterate mothers favour education of their children.
- Illiterate mothers are susceptible to the influence of literate fathers as is seen in category families.
- 4. Illiterate fathers have less influence on the attitude of their mothers.

Internal reasons for low enrolment

- Distance as well as lack of school facilities
- Defective textbooks and curriculum both are beyond the comprehension level of students.
- Harsh attitude of teacher

6. External reasons for low Enrolment

- 1. Poverty of parents
- Parent's lack of understanding of the value of education.
- 3. Opportunity cost to the parents by sending the Child to school

7. Causes of Low Enrolment of girls

Following is a list of the basic causes of low enrollments of girls at all levels of education, and continuing gender gaps in literacy and participation rates, as identified by different research studies.

- Poverty, illiteracy and conservatism of the parents, generating negative attitudes against the education of girls.
- Low base level of female education at the time of independence
 and the persistent obsession of parents, planners and community
 leaders that the first available educational facility must be reserved
 for boys.
- Demand for separate girls schools and lack of adequate financial support.
- Non-availability of qualified and experienced female school teachers and neglect of basic physical facilities for girls schools.
- Lack of incentives for girls to attend schools and teachers to take
 up teaching duties with commitment and devotion.
- Irrelevant curricula and ineffective teaching methodology for multi-grade teaching in schools where two teachers teach five

- classes in one or two rooms.
- Inhibiting role of uneducated mothers and severe attitudinal barriers to girls education in the rural and tribal areas.
- Non-existence of girls primary schools or unavailability of schools at an accessible distance.
- Heavy population growth-rate and the burden of household work falling on young girls.
- Absence of essential facilities like drinking water, mats for squatting or benches for sitting, urinals and space for playing in existing girls schools.
- Apathy of the community and an ineffective supervisory system.
- Poor impact of non-governmental organizations on the motivation of parents and girls.

ISSUES IN PARTICIPATION

1. Existing Participating Rate

Notwithstanding the fact that statistics are not very reliable and structural differences do exist between regions and especially at the grade I level. In many cases grade I is completed in two years where Katchi (Pre-Primary) and Pucci (Grade I) exist as amalgamated class while in others it takes just a year. The participation rate according to Economic Survey 1999-2000 is 89% (boys 99% & girls 79%) if these figures are compared with 1947, when Pakistan achieved independence, we find that the total participation rate then was 17%. However, for boys and girls if taken separately it was 30% and 5% respectively. It implies that Pakistan has indeed tried to enhance participation rates and rectify the imbalance between boys and girls which, to start with, was very formidable in view of abysmally low base.

The disparity between the participation rates of boys and girls is compounded by rural and urban disparities. The situation makes the rural girls at disadvantage. Then there are regions which are socio-economically more advanced as compared to others which are backward to varying degrees. The participation rates specially of girls in the backward places is far less than the national average. Thus unevenness in the availability of educational facilities and their utilization by the general population is the first characteristic that strikes an observer. Such a disparity prevails in spite of all efforts made for democratization of education at the first level.

In any large sample of a population there are as many boys as girls in a certain age bracket.

This fact is universally true. The number of boys schools at the primary level are double their number for girls in Pakistan. And yet overcrowding is to be seen in boys' schools rather than in those for girls'. This situation clearly indicates that the enrolment ratio of girls is much lower than that of boys as already mentioned. The reasons behind has already been mentioned at 3.2.

2 Drop-out

In the case of children who enroll with the system, the problem which affects the participation of children adversely is that of drop-outs. It is unusually high and at some rural places it is even more than 60%. The causes for such a heavy drop-out rate are:-

- the existence of two levels of junior and senior at grade I and the practice of admitting children in schools of an age much below five. Neither the conditions prevailing in the schools are attractive nor are the children prepare for such a drastic change. There is hardly a child who does not feel unhappy with the new arrangement. Hence at the first available opportunity he bowls out;
- the hydrogenate of age composition of students where the older students bully younger ones acts as a deterrent preventing the child from attending
 the school;
- the practice of making fresh admissions throughout the year results that a child admitted late suffers from the fear that he lags behind others;

- over-crowding in classes makes it impossible for the teacher to pay individual attention and attend to their specific difficulties based on individual differences;
- curricula are extra bookish (not functional) and they contain concepts far
 too abstract for the age of the child;
- the language of the book being different from the mother tongue of the child makes acquisition of reading skills a really difficult task;
- inadequate pre-service training of teachers does not equip them to cope with the tasks which lie ahead. Very few teachers really know what a child is and how can be helped in the realization of his potential; and
- the existence of a wrong system of examinations in which all the responsibility is placed on the shoulders of a child.

Having enrolled children in a school, it is essential to see that the progress from year to year and that they do not leave the school till they complete the prescribed class. The National Education Policy 1972 specifically stressed that the system of annual examinations should be replaced by a process of continuous evaluation throughout the year and that promotion from one grade to next should be automatic. However, for reasons of resistance from teachers neither of these features could be made effective. As much as 10% of children have to repeat grades and this is another factor which promotes dropping out.

3. Non-Enrollments reasons of low participation

Why is it that parents do not send their children to schools? The causes for

this problem are varied and many. It is another manifestation of the state of underdevelopment with which we suffer. Apparently we are caught up in a syndrome of poverty, tradition, low productivity, inertia and backwardness. There are in-school factors as well as out-of-school elements responsible for it such as:-

- unattractive school plants with over-crowded classes with very few facilities for play;
- harsh rough and un-psychological pupil teacher equation based on exaggerated expectations of pupil's academic performance on the part of teachers;
- extra emphasis on the traditional processes of rote memorization, chanting and drill;
- incompatibility between the class-room methodology and the stage of
- cognitive development of children:
- emphasis on autocratic teaching rather than providing for democratic learning;
- content being extra bookish rather than functional possessing little relevance to the actual life;
- extra rigid school rules and regulation demanding utmost conformity.
- a sizeable segment of society persisting below the poverty line for whom it is
 really difficult to meet the social costs of the education of their children over
 and above their opportunity costs;

- traditional apathy towards girls education;
- low status of teachers and their dissatisfaction with their profession
- teachers possessing very inadequate general qualifications as well as very meager professional training;
- the existence of a state of apathy towards formal education by the illiterate section of society.

The Government of Pakistan is presently taking a number of practical measures with a view to ensuring access to school-going age. Some of these measures are as follows:

- New schools and classrooms shall be constructed where objective demographic criteria indicate their urgent need. Preference shall be given to female schools.
- The performance of existing of schools shall be improved and their full and optimum utilization shall be ensured. New schools shall be constructed only where need is validated by independent monitors. Schools shall be located as close as possible to clusters of homes where children live rather than where influential people may prefer to have them.
- Area/District based targets and programs shall be developed for the promotion of elementary education and literacy which may be supervised District Education .
 Authority.
- An incentive-oriented approach shall be adopted for the communities, villages and

- or completes the prescribed course;
- implementing a programme of qualitative improvement with a view to enhancing the holding power of the system;
- designing and following a new school calendar more suited to communities living in villages to synchronize with cropping pattern;
- launching a massive programme of in-service and pre-service training of teachers
 designed with a view to bringing about the desirable teacher behavior inside the
 class; and
- Transforming the existing supervision system and modernizing it in such a way that
 the teaching force gets the professional support and guidance that it needs to do its to
 overcome the great menace of wastage following measures can be suggested.

ISSUES AND CONCERNS RELATED TO CURRICULUM

There has been a re-thinking in the educational circles about the nature and duration of education that is imparted in the ordinary schools. Expert opinion now generally favors the lengthening of general education and the postponement of specialized study to a later period in the secondary school courses. The bulk of the core curriculum is on the increase. Adoption of dynamic and stimulating methods for the presentation of essential knowledge is vigorously being recommended. The learning process is becoming student centered rather than teacher centered putting greater emphasis on self-learning styles of students and use of problem solving techniques. All these new directions require reforms of the school curriculum.

The Existing Situation

Against the background of the striking curricular developments that are taking place abroad, the school curriculum in Pakistan which is centralized for the whole country will be found to be very narrowly conceived and largely out-of-date. Education is a three-fold process of imparting knowledge, developing skills and inculcating proper interests, attitudes and values. Our schools (and also our colleges) are mostly conceived with the first part of the process - the imparting of knowledge - and carry it out in an unsatisfactory way. The curriculum places a premium on bookish knowledge and rote learning, makes inadequate provision for practical activities and experiences and is dominated by examinations. It caters to mental operations of the lower order in our children. The development of useful skills and the inculcation of the right kind of interests, attitudes and values are not given sufficient emphasis. The existing curriculum is not only out of step with modern knowledge but also

out of tune with the life of the people. Thus there is urgent need to raise, upgrade and improve the existing curriculum.

The major curricular revisions attempted so far in Pakistan have been by and large on adhoc basis and were not adequately backed by sustained research, and supporting measures as adequate preparation of learning materials, the training of teachers or the provision of the needed physical facilities. What is worse, the curricula even for the lower grades are centralized and are the same for the urban and the rural areas, for the hilly and the plain regions and for the irrigated fertile lands and the arid desert expanse. Such extra rigidity cramps the freedom of teachers and renders innovative work almost impossible. It also makes curriculum revision very difficult and infrequent. This problem which faces education at all stages is particularly acute at the school level. It is this weakness of school education that compels colleges to spend time on what is essentially school work; and the content of higher education cannot be adequately depended until the school curricula are upgraded and made more challenging.

CONCLUSIONS

- There are acute imbalances in the matter of enrolment of children in the various parts of the
 country and amongst it various sections the disparities in the domain of cognitive
 achievements of these children are even more glaring. As a matter of fact, the achievement
 gap in education is even of greater concern.
- 2. Equalization of opportunity is very important for the vast majority of people living in the rural areas and belonging to disadvantaged sections of the population. But this equalization should not mean only the facility of attending school. It should mean the provision of quality education and facilities of developing some basic competencies as a result of the sequence of learning that takes place as the child progresses in school.
- 3. It is necessary to resort to the various mobilities of education -formal, non-formal and informal to achieve the goal of Universalization of primary education. In view of the socio-economic, cultural and geographical variations the programme of Universalization of primary education (UPE) will have a pronounced emphasis on local specific relevant learning experiences through decentralized curriculum development. Necessary local variations and adaptations ought to be reflected in the instructional materials and methods as the programme should be characterized by:
 - (a) flexibility and variety of learning experiences,
 - (b) formal and non-formal system and
 - (c) provision for multiple entry into the formal system of education.

Another way to answer the related issues are the development of Minimum Learning Continuum based on competencies to be expected of all children at the end of the primary stage of education (grade I to V). On the bases of this conceptual paper the following specifically suggestions are made to contemplate in the programme of UPE.

- A minimum learning continuum based on the most essential competencies be defined to form a common base for all learners, irrespective of their mode of learning;
- Learning episodes should be developed relating to local specific situations to make learning relevant; and standardized.
- Graded tests should be evolved to help learners achieve the desired level of competencies; and
- There should be decentralization and flexibility in the development of curriculum and its organizations.

The worst criticism so far as the existing curriculum is concerned is the fact that the same lays extra stress on filling a child's mind with a lump of knowledge - mainly names, dates and statistics - rather than helping him develop his understanding of things and stimulating his curiosity, imagination and creativity. A look at the contents of many of the text-books is enough to show how unrealistic and unproductively demanding are the expectations of our educational managers. For instance, a child of 9 in class IV is asked to learn, among other things, about the administrative units, the high court, the provincial assembly, the Auqaf Department and so on for reasons not all obvious. It is not surprising that most children spend lot of time in memorizing all such information and lose real interest in learning during the process. The demand is far more on the retentive power of the memory than on the critical traits of the mind. Finally, the teaching methods in vogue with extra

- 1990s. A Background Study, Islamabad 1999.
- Ministry of Education "The National Education Policy 1998-2010" Islamabad 1999.
- Ghafoor Abdul et al "Relationship between five year schooling and literacy status of parents", AEPAM, Islamabad 1999.
- Khawaja Sarfraz, a Conceputal Paper on new development in Primary Education in Pakistan. AEPAM, Islamabad, 1985.
- Bhattai Ahmad Mukhtar "Primary Education improvement" desired measures, NEC,
 Islamabad, 1986.
- Khawaja Sarfraz "Primary Education in Pakistan and other Asian Countries" AEPAM,
 Islamabad, 1985.
- Khawaja Sarfraz "Basic Education for all policies & plans" review 1947-1989 pictroial printer, Islamabad, 1989.
- Ghafoor Abdul "Primary Education of the girl child in Pakistan" AEPAM, Islamabad
 1990.

emphasis on reading the text books leaves much to be desired. Not trained in the latest techniques themselves, teachers cannot compensate for these inadequacies. Thus, there is an obvious need to revamp this system of primary education as it exists now.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Government of Pakistan, National Planning Board (1957). The First Five Year Plan (1955-60).
 - Government of Pakistan, The Planning Commission (1960), The Second Five Year Plan (1960-65).
 - Government of Pakistan, The Planning Commission, Sixth Five Year Plan (1983-88),
 Islamabad, 1983.
 - Government of Pakistan, Finance Division, Pakistan Economic Survey (1983-84), and
 Islamabad, 1984.
 - Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Education, National Education Policy 1979
 Islamabad.
 - Government of Pakistan, Primary Education Project, Draft Comprehensive Report the Islamabad, 1984.
 - Government of Pakistan Ministry of Education (Curriculum Wing). Teacher's Education in Pakistan, the, Islamabad, 1977.
 - Pak-German Basic Education Project 1985, Report on "Construction and Utilization of Lesson Plans, Teaching Units and Teaching Modules workshop, NWFP Education Department and G.T.Z., Peshawar.
 - Government of Pakistan Planning Commission (1994), the 8th Five Year Plan (1993-98).
 - UNESCO "Education for All 2000 Assessment country report Pakistan" Islamabad 2000.
 - 11. UNESCO " Basic Education and Pakistan". Progress on EFA Targets Dimension in

whereas only 16% director/DEOs have power to do important role in school management.

- The 66% manager are satisfied with the existing management system, where are
 34% wants change.
- Provision of proper school building is demanded by 20% in order to improve the system.
- District school management and local community representative both have the same (21%) of monitoring teaching and learning process.
- Less than 50% of the working teachers hold Bachelor's degree, but the percentage in Islamabad of degree holder is almost twice as that of Rawalpindi.
- More professional qualified teachers are available in Islamabad as compared to Rawalpindi. (5.2% hold M.Ed. and 15% teachers hold PTC). This shows that small number of professionally qualified teachers are available.
- In Islamabad district more experienced teachers are available whereas in Rawalpindi district teachers have less experience as compared to Islamabad.
- 20. School management committees are functioning in 24% institutions whereas 16% institutions have parents teachers association. About 30% schools can obtain donation from the community in form of land or cash, whereas 43%, schools obtain voluntary service by the community.
- Female teachers (72.8%) are working in elementary level institutions on the contrary only 27.2%, male teaches work at this level.
- Every District Education Officer has to do a lot of office work and attend numerous meetings. He/She has a little time for supervision and management of schools.
- Most of the DEOs/Dy. DEOs and AEOs have no office accommodation of their own.
- The AEOs are 17-graders but are non-gazetted for which they feel small.
- No clerk is attached with the AEOs.
- 26. Raw hand S.S.Ts. are appointed as A.E.Os who invite audit objections and

administrative problems.

- A large number of Primary Schools and Middle Schools are to be supervised by an AEO which is not possible.
- 28. Lack of funds under the T.A. head.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- School management committees and teacher parent associations are playing vital role in the development of the educational facilities. It is recommended that community participation should be enhanced and encouraged in order to share the govt. responsibilities.
- It is recommended that community representatives may be involved in monitoring the school activities as well as of the absenteeism of the teachers.
- Female teachers (72.8%) are working in elementary level institution, it is recommended that
 it should be enhanced upto 100% so that employment opportunities for female teachers could
 be enhanced. Moreover female teachers can impart knowledge at this level in effective
 manners.
- Policy implementation should the ensured so that proper effectiveness of the policy could be evaluated.
- It is recommended that Federal Govt. should implement the Education Policy through District Management. They should be directly responsible to provide educational facilities in respective districts.
- 6. Monitoring system is not satisfactory it should be designed to cater the requirement.
- District management need to be trained in handling financial matter as well as school administration.

Headmasters/headteachers play vital in school management. It is recommended that
headteachers may be given more administrative and financial powers in order to run the
institutions in efficient manner.

- It is further recommended that proper school building may be built before establishing institution.
- School management committees and teacher parent associations are playing vital role in the
 development of the educational facilities. It is recommended that community participation
 should be enhanced and encouraged in order to share the govt. responsibilities.
- It is recommended that community representatives may be involved in monitoring the school activities as well as of the absenteeism of the teachers.
- 12. Female teachers (72.8%) are working in elementary level institution, it is recommended that it should be enhanced upto 100% so that employment opportunities for female teachers could be enhanced. Moreover female teachers can impart knowledge at this level in effective manners.
- Policy implementation should the ensured so that proper effectiveness of the policy could be evaluated.
- 14. It is recommended that Federal Govt. should implement the Education Policy through District Management. They should be directly responsible to provide educational facilities in respective districts.

- 15. Tehsil be considered as a unit for primary level in the province as the admission of primary school teachers and their appointments are made Tehsil-wise. Certain powers regarding sanction of leave upto 3 months and transfers within the sub-division/Markaz be delegated to the A.E.O. and also to impose minor penalty, then the 60% burden of the DEO will be shared by the Tehsil, Markaz officers. The establishment check register and budget/accounts check registers may also be maintained by the Tehsil Officers. The inter Tehsil transfers will remain the responsibility of the DEO.
- 16. The separate office accommodation is basic requirement of the DEOs/Dy. DEOs/AEOs at their headquarters with necessary equipment. Residential accommodation should also be provided to them like other departments.
- 17. The AEOs' post be declared gazetted in like other departments keeping in view their qualifications, the present assignment as D.D.O. in respect of pay of the staff working under him supervision.
- 18. He may be provided with a senior clerk well conversant with the financial and service rules as he has to keep the service record of the teachers working in his Sub-Division.
- 19. The A.E.Os. and Tehsil Officers be given pre-job training in respect of accounts, service matters, rules and regarding the techniques of inspection evaluation and human relation-skills (Public dealing), so that they may be in a position to perform their duties efficiently, with confidence and in accordance with the rules. Arrangements for regular in-service training at regular intervals is a must. Only senior most S.S.Ts. be appointed as Headmasters of Middle Schools/A.E.Os. and they should be retained as such till their promotion as headmasters.
- 20. The number of schools in a sub-division should not exceed 50 in any case. The number of schools is increasing yearly but no additional posts of AEOs are created. It is really a point worth consideration because without regular visits/supervision and proper guidance in various fields, no improvement is possible.

- 21. Transfer be allowed on administrative grounds at all time.
- The department often loses litigation cases for want of proper legal advice.
- A post of litigation officer with B.A. L.L.B., qualifications be created in each district to deal
 with the litigation cases of the department.
- 24. Trained/Qualified Accountants are not posted in the office.
- A post of A.E.O. (Accounts) be sanctioned in each district which will minimize the financial irregularities in Punjab like other provinces.
- 26. DEOS/Dy. DEOs and AEOs are required to pay visits to the schools at least for 10 days in a month but funds under T.A. head are not provided accordingly. Rs. 25,000/- per AEO should be allocated and Rs.45,000/- for DEO/Dy should be allocated yearly.
- Vacant posts of Headmasters/Headmistresses and SSTs are not filled up for months together which create administrative/educational problems.
- 28. Vacancies of Headmasters/Headmistresses of high schools and those of SSTs are not filled up soon after their occurrence which spoils the administrative/educational equilibrium of schools. The vacant posts should be filled up within one month. A monitoring cell be created at provincial/divisional level and selection/recruitment committees should meet every month to fill up the vacancies.
- 29. No officer should be allowed to work more than three years at one place of posting. The DEOs/Dy. DEOs/AEOs having satisfactory work should be replaced by new ones after every 3 years. Their reports regarding administrative needs be given due consideration for streamlining the administration.

- 30. Reorientation Courses: Training acquired once is never sufficient. During the present science/space age, new techniques in every sphere of life have been found. Therefore, reorientation and refreshing of knowledge already gained is an 'Essential'.
- Frequent refresher courses in all fields of Education preferably once in five years be conducted for every teacher, DEO/Dy. DEO.
- Community Participation: Parent Teachers associations and school committees are notexisting in the schools, with the result that the community has lost interest in the educational institutions.
- School committees and parents committees be revived in the schools for the betterment of the schools and the general uplift of the education.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Nwankwo I. John (1982) "Educational administration theory and practice. Vikas Publishing House Pvt. Ltd., India.
- Gorton A. Richard (1983) "School administration and supervision. Leadership challenges and opportunities". Brown Company Publishers Dubuque, IA.
- Chaudhrase Karan Premia (1994). "Educational planning and management" Sterling Publishing private limited, Delhi.
- Shah Saeed (1999) "Educational Management" Braving Boundaries. National Book Foundation. Islamabad.
- Bovee L. Courtland and Thill V. John, et al. (1993). "Management" McGraw-Hill, New York.
- Zaki, W. M. (1988). "Educational Management", National Book Foundation, Islamabad.